



Contents lists available at [Journal IICET](#)
JPPi (Jurnal Penelitian Pendidikan Indonesia)
ISSN: 2502-8103 (Print) ISSN: 2477-8524 (Electronic)
Journal homepage: <https://jurnal.iicet.org/index.php/jppi>



The review of organization commitment: the effects of performance assessment, career planning, and employee's participations

Silvy Sondari Gadzali

Fakultas Ilmu Administrasi, Universitas Subang Pasirkareumbi, Indonesia

Article Info

Article history:

Received Oct 19th, 2022
Revised Jan 02th, 2023
Accepted Jun 17th, 2023

Keyword:

Performance appraisal system,
Career planning,
Employee participation,
Organizational commitment

ABSTRACT

Much empiric research had been conducted on the antecedents of employee organizational commitment. However, there is still less research hate xamines the effect of HR management praxis, such as performance appraisal systems, career planning systems, and employee participation on organizational commitment. In this study,the purpose of this research is to know the impact of these three variables in explaining employee work commitments in the banking sector in West Java. Based on a survey of 98 employees in 20 private banks in West Java, this study uses regression analysis, correlation analysis, and G-test to test hypotheses. The results showed that the performance appraisal system, career planning system and employee participation significantly influence employee work commitment. This result also indicates that the levelof organizational commitment of employees in the private banking sector in West Java islow. Therefore, this study suggests that for employees to be genuinely committed to theirwork, companies must make objective efforts in managing performance appraisals, career planning, and employee participation to ensure effective implementation and to achieve expected results.



© 2023 The Authors. Published by IICET.

This is an open access article under the CC BY-NC-SA license
(<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-sa/4.0>)

Corresponding Author:

Silvy Sondari Gadzali,
Universitas Subang Pasirkareumbi
Email: silvysondari@unsub.ac.id

Introduction

Energetic, competent, passionate, productive, innovative and highly committed Human Resources (HR) are the most important success factors in today's increasingly volatile and competitive business world. Recognizing that HR is a valuable asset and a source of competitive advantage, companies need to pay attention to the effectiveness of their performance appraisal system, career planning, and employee participation. In addition, it is also important for companies to see how much impact these practices have in increasing employee commitment. An organization's success, resilience, and competitiveness depend on the commitment of its members, and this can greatly depend on how satisfied employees are with the company's appraisal mechanisms, participation in decision-making, and career planning strategies. Therefore, the concept of organizational commitment (organizational commitment) plays an important role in the philosophy of HR management. As stated (Şahin et al., 2017), HR management is designed to optimize organizational performance, employee commitment, flexibility and improve the quality of work results.

It is important to understand the relationship between individuals and organizations within the framework of the concept of organizational commitment. In many literatures on management and behavioral science, organizational commitment is seen as a vital factor in the relationship between individuals and organizations. For example, organizational commitment is a factor that encourages individual attachment to the organization (Mikkelsen et al., 2015). Employees who voluntarily relate to the organization and devote efforts to achieve organizational goals can be said to be individuals who have committed to the organization.

Issues related to organizational commitment are becoming increasingly important because of their relationship with intention to leave and employee turnover (Aragon Amonarriz & Iturrioz Landart, 2016). Meanwhile, many antisendents have been proposed for organizational commitment, HR management practices such as employee participation systems, performance appraisals and career planning systems have not received much attention in determining the antecedents of organizational commitment (Hawker, 2016; Mikkelsen et al., 2015). However, the existing literature has not presented empirical results that simultaneously put forward the internal company such as performance appraisal system, career planning, and internal employee employee participation simultaneously. The position of the research is on efforts to develop an empirical simultaneous conception of the effect of performance appraisal systems, career planning, and employee participation on organizational commitment to bank employees in West Java.

Based on research findings (Du Plessis & Van Niekerk, 2017; Kamphorst & Swank, 2018) related to performance appraisal, career planning, employee participation, and organizational commitment, it turns out that the correlation of these variables is based on the fact that performance appraisal, career planning, and effective employee participation will not have an impact on increasing work commitment from employees. So that performance appraisal, career planning, and employee participation have no significant effect on organizational commitment.

Empirical findings on people's credit bank employees in Garut have a good perception of support from the organization to them when doing work. Employees are also satisfied with their current job, and it turns out that the test results of their level of affective commitment are quite high. The perception of the support variable from the company has a positive and significant effect on job satisfaction, but does not have a significant impact on affective commitment. While job satisfaction has a positive and significant effect on affective commitment. The results of the data processing using macro process software were found to have a mediating influence on job satisfaction which had an effect on the high perception of organizational support and the high affective commitment of employees (Kristanti et al., 2019). Likewise, research on the effect of leadership style on high organizational commitment mediated by job satisfaction and employee trust in the largest bank in DKI Jakarta shows the results that there is a positive influence of leadership style on organizational commitment mediated by job satisfaction and trust (Zahra, 2015). So that the level of organizational commitment in the banking sector in West Java is high.

Empirical findings on people's credit bank employees in Garut have a good perception of support from the organization to them when doing work. Employees are also satisfied with their current jobs, and it turns out that their affective commitment level test results are quite high. The variable perception of support from the company has a positive and significant effect on job satisfaction, but has no significant effect on affective commitment. While job satisfaction has a positive and significant effect on affective commitment. The results of data processing using macro processing software were found to have a mediating effect on job satisfaction which had an effect on perceptions of high organizational support and high employee affective commitment (Kristanti et al. 2019). Similarly, research on the influence of leadership style on high organizational commitment mediated by job satisfaction and employee trust in the largest bank in DKI Jakarta shows the results that there is a positive influence of leadership style on organizational commitment mediated by job satisfaction and trust (Zahra, 2015). So, the level of organizational commitment to the banking sector in West Java is quite high.

This study is going to investigate about variables organization on employee commitment, the effect of employee commitment on company performance. The findings of this study indicate that the high perception of the organization's external contribution does not have a positive and significant effect on the high commitment of employees, the perception of internal organizational support also has no positive and significant effect on employee commitment. So there is no significant relationship between organizational commitment and performance appraisal, career planning, and employee participation.

The purpose of this study was to examine the work commitment of bank employees in West Java and to examine the level of relationship between organizational commitment and performance appraisal systems, career planning, and employee participation in the banking sector in West Java.

Method

This study uses quantitative methods so that the outputs rely heavily on the validity and reliability of the data obtained from the interview process through the distribution of questionnaires.

The population of this study were all employees of 20 private banks in West Java, amounting to 9,749 people. The unit of analysis in this study is a private bank operating in West Java. In addition, a multi-rater response approach is also used. Three questionnaires were sent to each bank at the level of the main branch office which were targeted to fill out the questionnaires and become research respondents. The sample consisted of 98 people who returned the questionnaire.

Given the large number of population so it is not possible to apply in this study. So it is considered necessary to simplify in a more proportional amount but still meet the elements of research objectivity. Researchers have full authority to set the margin of error (Yalcin & Seker, 2016). As a consequence, the larger the error limit value applied, the smaller the sample size obtained. To accommodate this, the slovin formulation was used.

$$n = \frac{N}{1 + Ne^2} = \frac{9749}{1 + 9749 \cdot 10^{-2}} = 98,9$$

Note: n (samples to be obtained); N (number of population); e (margin of error is the error limit that shows the acceptable error for an estimated value).

The data used as processed descriptive statistics, correlation analysis, and multiple regression analysis. G-test is used to determine whether there is a significant difference between the observed level of organizational commitment and the expected value. While regression analysis was used to determine the predictors of performance appraisal, career planning, and employee participation on organizational commitment, correlation analysis was used to determine the relationship between the independent variables and the dependent variable. In this study, the items used to operationalize performance appraisal, career planning, employee participation and organizational commitment are taken from measuring instruments that have been validated and tested for reliability before, and adjusted to the objectives of this study.

Organizational commitment is measured by modifying the Organizational Commitment Questionnaire (Meyer and Allen, 1997 in Diamantidis & Chatzoglou, 2019). The purpose of these modifications is to fit the context of this research. Overall, organizational commitment was measured using an instrument consisting of 15 items measured using a 5-point scale. Performance appraisal, career planning, employee participation was measured using a validated scale.

Performance appraisal is measured using a scale consisting of 8 items. Respondents were asked to indicate the extent to which performance was evaluated based on quantifiable results and the use of performance appraisal data. In other words, they were asked to choose a scale of 1 (strongly disagree) to 7 (strongly agree) on statements related to the praxis of their workplace performance appraisal system. Career planning was measured using an instrument consisting of 7 items measured using a 7-point scale. Respondents were asked to answer statements related to the practices in the career planning system in their workplace.

Employee participation is measured using a scale consisting of 3 items. Respondents were asked to respond to statements about the extent to which superiors allow employees to participate in decision making and provide opportunities to provide suggestions for improvement. Similarly, this item uses a Likert scale of 1 (strongly disagree) to 7 (strongly agree).

The research model, which is based on a conceptual framework, is shown below:

$$OC = f(PAS, CPS, EP) \dots \dots \dots (1)$$

$$OC = f(PAS, CP, EP) \dots \dots \dots (2)$$

$$OC = \beta_0 + PAS\beta_1 + CPS\beta_2 + EP\beta_3 + e \dots \dots \dots (3)$$

Note: OC (Organizational commitment); PAS (Performance Assessment System); CPS (Career planning system); EP Employee Participation); 0 (constant term; 1, 2); 3 (coefficient of performance appraisal, career planning and employee participation); e (error term).

The calculations using the Slovin formula, the results obtained were 98.9 people. Of the 99 questionnaires distributed to 20 banks, 84 questionnaires were filled out and returned properly. This represents a response rate of 89.4%. So that the analysis was carried out based on 84 completed questionnaires and deserved further analysis.

Of the 84 respondents, 54 people or 64.3% have positions as Assistant Managers or more, while 35.7% of other respondents have positions below managerial positions. This shows that the respondents belong to the upper class employees, 35% of the respondents have a base in the HR department, 24% of the respondents work in the Marketing field, while 30% are in the Operations field, the remaining 11% are located in other departments such as the risk management department, the legal department, and other support units in their respective companies.

The majority of respondents 75% have at least five years of work experience. This shows that respondents have taken their careers seriously and devoted their time to understanding how the issues discussed in this study will affect them. 68% of respondents were male, while 32% were female. about 84% are over 35 years old. While the mean age of the respondents was 46.4 years.

Results and Discussions

According to the results of cronbach alpha reliability tests and item-to-total correlations were calculated to identify issues related to common method variance and to assess the internal consistency of several scales. Items with low item-to-total correlation indicate that the item does not reflect the construct used or has entered into another construct dimension. From the calculations as shown in Table 2, the Cronbach alpha value of 0.92 is above the minimum limit of 0.70, while the item-to-total correlation is above the recommended value of 0.5. Therefore, these results indicate a high level of internal consistency of the scale used.

Hypothesis 1 testing is carried out by considering performance appraisal, career planning, and employee participation have a significant influence on organizational commitment with multiple correlation (R) of 0.83 and adjusted R² of 0.71. This shows that 71% of the variation in organizational commitment is explained by three variables, namely performance appraisal, career planning, and employee participation. The standard coefficients of career appraisal, performance planning, and employee participation are shown in table 3. Thus, hypothesis 1 which states that performance appraisal, career planning, and employee participation has no significant effect on organizational commitment is proven.

Table 1. Descriptive statistics and item-to-total correlation

	Mean	SD	Item-to totalCorrelations
Performance assessment	28,43	2,74	,885
Career Planning	26,14	2,63	,906
Employee Participation	10,71	0,91	,707
Organizational Commitment	41,21	5,95	,830

Organizational commitment refers to how much identification and involvement of individual employees in an organization. Organizational commitment is influenced by three factors, namely the willingness of employees to remain part of the organization, a solid level of belief and acceptance of the direction and goals of the organization, and readiness to contribute more to the interests of the company(Boateng et al., 2016). It was further revealed that organization a commitment has three components, namely affective commitment, ongoing commitment, and normative commitment (Matin and Hamidizadeh, 2010 in Hardjati & Febrianita, 2019). These three components by (Mikkelsen et al. 2015) are expressed as the output of emotional attachment (affective commitment), the price that must be paid if you leave, such as loss of benefits or seniority (continuation commitment), and individual personal values (normative commitment).

Affective commitment relates to employees' attachment to identification and involvement in the organization. Therefore, affective commitment to the organization can be characterized by shared values, willingness to maintain membership and work without expecting benefits from the company. With affective commitment, employees seek to maintain their membership in the organization. Affective commitment refers to a sense of belonging and attachment to the organization. Employees who have this commitment are usually associated with personal characteristics, organizational structure, and work experience. Examples include salary, supervision, role clarity, and career paths. This is what drives the importance of companies facilitating employees with openness and counseling for employee career planning.

From the employee's perspective, how can employees who feel they have no future will survive in one organization. At least employees will work with low productivity. Employees who do not have a career plan will be overshadowed by the projection of greater consequences if they leave the organization than the consequences if they stay in the organization. In other words, employees do not want to leave the organization for fear of losing their salary, or not being able to find another job.

Employees who have clear career projections will be highly committed and stay because of loyalty because of a sense of obligation and the company's success in indoctrinating its employees. Such feelings can arise from a variety of sources. For example, the company has invested resources in providing training for its employees, which employees then feel they have a 'moral' obligation to devote to their work and stay with the company in order to be rewarded for their obligations. This commitment can also reflect the instilled norm, which was formed before joining the company through family and other social processes, that employees must be loyal to the company.

Testing hypothesis 2 which states that the level of organizational commitment in the banking sector in West Java is high. The average score of organizational commitment is 41.21, in other words, the level of work commitment of employees in the sector.

Banking in West Java is at a moderate level (54.9%). To test the significance of job commitment of employees in the banking sector in West Java, we calculated the G-test with the aim of ascertaining whether the level of organizational commitment as shown above is significantly different from the expected level of commitment. It can be emphasized that to be said to be at the middle (moderate) level, the value of organizational commitment should not be less than 55%. Therefore, the value used in calculating the G-test is 55%.

The critical value (critical value) X^2 for degrees of freedom is 13 (N-1) at the 95% confidence level is 24.25. Since the empirical value (the calculated value G) is 9.039 and less than 24.25, it can be said that the result is not statistically significant. Therefore, the null hypothesis (H_0) which states that the level of organizational commitment in the banking sector in West Java is high is rejected.

Table 2. Results of the standard regression model

	Standard coefficient	t-values
Performance assessment	0,463	0,434
Career Planning	0,131	0,116
Employee Participation	0,339	1,414
R	0,844	
R ²	0,627	
nilai-F	8,288*	

This empirical finding is successful in linking organizational commitment with several constructs or concepts such as performance appraisal, career planning, and employee participation. This also directly supports the application in the practice of organizational behavior such as leadership style, and trust in the organization which are some of the organizational factors associated with organizational commitment.

It is known that participatory-based management and supervisory feedback affect the level of normative commitment, continuance commitment, and affective commitment of employees. That when supervisors provide performance-related responses and welcome employees to participate in decision making, their level of affective commitment will increase and be stronger than their level of normative and sustainability commitment. Thus, these employees confirm that employees will remain in the company not because they need or have to, but rather because they want to.

The relationship between affective commitment, continuance commitment, and normative commitment with other types of commitment, namely work involvement, job involvement, and career commitment was found to be mutually reinforcing. So it is known that affective commitment has a stronger correlation with all types of commitment. In other words, employees who stay with the company because they want it have a higher level of commitment to their work and career.

On the other hand, training in developing committed employees must receive management priority. Training encourages a sense of belonging among employees. The executive development program also seems to be a platform to produce employees who have a strong commitment. Research (Perdana & Mardiana, 2018; Seierstad & Kirton, 2015) found that employee expectations are usually not met and that job characteristics, training and development, and compensation and fairness are related to satisfaction and commitment. also found that commitment was significantly related to the level of trust, job involvement, and job satisfaction. Organizational commitment provides a platform for employees to stay in the organization.

Job satisfaction and affective commitment will be positively related to performance and leadership in general, while continuance commitment shows a negative relationship. As predicted, job satisfaction was positively related to performance, although not with leadership. Continuity commitment is negatively related to both performance and leadership. Increased organizational commitment is also positively associated with

valuable organizational outcomes, including performance ratings, decreased intention to seek a new job, and decreased interest in leaving work (Ghosh et al., 2013; Mitonga-Monga & Cilliers, 2016).

There is a positive relationship between resource enrichment and affective and normative commitments and also a negative relationship between continuous commitment and resource enrichment. As a result, employees who stay in the organization because of their own desires show higher involvement and enjoy activities work activity. Meanwhile, employees who stay in the organization because they feel the need show lower involvement and dissatisfaction with work activities. In line with research (Pentareddy & Suganthi, 2015; Seierstad & Kirton, 2015) which is to examine the relationship between affective, ongoing, and normative commitments with non-occupational factors of resource enrichment.

Testing hypothesis 3 which states that there is no significant relationship between organizational commitment and performance appraisal, career planning, and employee participation is proven to be acceptable.

As shown in Table 3, there is a positive and significant relationship between the performance appraisal system and organizational commitment with a zero-order correlation of 0.57. Correspondingly, the career planning system and employee participation were also found to be associated with organizational commitment with values of 0.59 and 0.63.

Table 3. The correlation matrix of measurement variables

Variable	1	2	3	4
Performance assessment	1,00	,96**	,48*	,57**
Career Planning		1,00	,54*	,59**
Employee Participation			1,00	,63**
Organizational Commitment				1,00

As the main objective of this study is to determine the effect of performance appraisal, career planning, and employee participation on organizational commitment. The results of this study confirm that performance appraisal, career planning, and employee participation are the main antecedents of organizational commitment. These results indicate that performance appraisal, career planning, and employee participation have a positive and significant effect on organizational commitment. This shows that the higher the value of HR practices, the higher the level of employee work commitment and organizational commitment.

The findings of this study also show that the level of organizational commitment of private banking employees in West Java is low. This finding confirms the research hypothesis which states that private bank employees in West Java are less committed to their jobs than companies that are committed to their employees. In addition, low organizational commitment will be the cause of the decline in performance. The employees only make their current job temporary and as a stepping stone to find the desired place of work and as a fulfillment of work experience qualifications. Because many employees do not want to work in the Bank for a long period of time.

The results also show that organizational commitment is positively related to employee performance appraisal, career planning, and employee participation. This means that the higher the level of performance appraisal, career planning and employee participation, the higher the level of organizational commitment.

The company can monitor the development of employee attitudes and behavior through an assessment mechanism. This assessment-based information can be used to modify selection practices and training practices to select and develop expected employee behaviors and attitudes. However, the effectiveness of skilled employees will be limited, unless they are motivated to do their jobs.

Assessment of employee performance will only be effective if it is carried out by meeting fair and objective elements. Fair if it is based on agreed standards and objectives are the values given according to the level of achievement. In order for a fair assessment there are five elements that must be considered, namely clear performance targets; mutually agreed targets; targets related to job descriptions; face-to-face meetings and discussions. Meanwhile, to conduct an objective assessment, the following six elements must be considered, namely, actual data; positive and negative employee behavior; courage or decisiveness; a structured assessment system; uncomplicated forms; ability to judge (Birecikli et al., 2016).

A well-functioning career planning system will be able to encourage employees to be more responsible for their development, including the development of skills that are considered important in the company (Park, 2015). A well-planned career development system, followed by advancement opportunities, will result in high

motivation for employees, which will have an impact on company performance (Santoni & Heryono, 2021; Sugiarto & Panjaitan, 2021).

Participation is about how employees play a more active role in decision-making activities. Employee participation is an arrangement that ensures that employees have the opportunity to influence management decisions and contribute to organizational performance. The level of participation of non-managerial employees in decision making differs from company to company.

Managerial Implications

The managerial implication in this research is to direct the formation of the management of employee commitment, namely so that the mechanism for conveying dissatisfaction with employee performance appraisals is more considered. to correct problems with management or prevent deteriorating relationships through counseling and career planning. Companies should pay attention to the attitudes and expressions of the collective organization of employees. to provide a source of strength that serves as a counterweight to management; Contribution to management decision making - to improve organization, quality and employee commitment; and anticipate demonstrations of mutualistic and cooperative relationships in order to achieve long-term sustainability for employees and the company.

Conclusions

The results showed that performance appraisal, career planning, and employee participation had a positive influence on organizational commitment. In addition, the results of the study also show that the level of organizational commitment is low. These results, broadly, prove the added value of performance appraisal, career planning, and employee participation in increasing organizational commitment.

References

- Aragon Amonarriz, C., & Iturrioz Landart, C. (2016). Responsible family ownership in small-and medium-sized family enterprises: An exploratory study. *Business Ethics: A European Review*, 25(1), 75–93.
- Birecikli, B., Alphan, L., Ertürk, A., & Aksoy, S. (2016). Employees' need for independence, organizational commitment, and turnover intentions: The moderating role of justice perceptions about performance appraisals. *International Journal of Organizational Leadership*, 5, 270–284.
- Boateng, A., Akamavi, R. K., & Ndoro, G. (2016). Measuring performance of non-profit organisations: evidence from large charities. *Business Ethics: A European Review*, 25(1), 59–74.
- Diamantidis, A. D., & Chatzoglou, P. (2019). Factors affecting employee performance: an empirical approach. *International Journal of Productivity and Performance Management*, 68(1), 171–193. <https://doi.org/10.1108/IJPPM-01-2018-0012>
- Du Plessis, T., & Van Niekerk, A. (2017). Factors influencing managers' attitudes towards performance appraisal. *SA Journal of Human Resource Management*, 15(1), 1–10.
- Ghosh, P., Satyawadi, R., Prasad Joshi, J., & Shadman, M. (2013). Who stays with you? Factors predicting employees' intention to stay. *International Journal of Organizational Analysis*, 21(3), 288–312. <https://doi.org/10.1108/IJOA-Sep-2011-0511>
- Hardjati, S., & Febrianita, R. (2019). The power of interpersonal communication skill in enhancing service provision. *Journal of Social Science Research*, 14, 3192–3199.
- Hawker, F. H. (2016). Female specialists in intensive care medicine: job satisfaction, challenges and work-life balance. *Critical Care and Resuscitation*, 18(2), 125–131.
- Kamphorst, J. J. A., & Swank, O. H. (2018). The role of performance appraisals in motivating employees. *Journal of Economics & Management Strategy*, 27(2), 251–269.
- Kristanti, F. T., Prasetyo, A. P., Putri, N. N. S., & Salsabila, S. N. (2019). Komitmen Afektif pada Karyawan BPR di Garut; Analisis Pengaruh langsung dari Persepsi Dukungan Organisasi dan Peran Mediasi Kepuasan Kerja. *ISEI Business and Management Review*, 3(1), 7–15.
- Mikkelsen, A. C., York, J. A., & Arritola, J. (2015). Communication competence, leadership behaviors, and employee outcomes in supervisor-employee relationships. *Business and Professional Communication Quarterly*, 78(3), 336–354.
- Mitonga-Monga, J., & Cilliers, F. (2016). Perceived ethical leadership: Its moderating influence on employees' organisational commitment and organisational citizenship behaviours. *Journal of Psychology in Africa*, 26(1), 35–42.
- Park, R. (2015). Employee participation and outcomes: organizational strategy does matter. *Employee Relations*, 37(5), 604–622. <https://doi.org/10.1108/ER-09-2014-0107>
- Pentareddy, S., & Suganthi, L. (2015). Building affective commitment through job characteristics, leadership

-
- and empowerment. *Journal of Management & Organization*, 21(3), 307–320.
- Perdana, K., & Mardiana, N. (2018). How Managers Perceive Internal Corporate Social Responsibility: An Empirical Study of Indonesian Women's Employment. In *Redefining Corporate Social Responsibility* (Vol. 13, pp. 177–192). Emerald Publishing Limited. <https://doi.org/10.1108/S2043-052320180000013013>
- Şahin, F., Gürbüz, S., & Şeşen, H. (2017). Leaders' managerial assumptions and transformational leadership: the moderating role of gender. *Leadership & Organization Development Journal*, 38(1), 105–125. <https://doi.org/10.1108/LODJ-11-2015-0239>
- Santoni, A., & Heryono, G. (2021). Pengaruh kepemimpinan dan lingkungan kerja terhadap komitmen organisasi: peran mediasi kepuasan kerja. *Jurnal Aplikasi Bisnis Dan Manajemen (JABM)*, 7(3), 796.
- Seierstad, C., & Kirton, G. (2015). Having it all? Women in high commitment careers and work–life balance in Norway. *Gender, Work & Organization*, 22(4), 390–404.
- Sugiarto, A., & Panjaitan, R. (2021). Pengaruh motivasi dan lingkungan kerja terhadap kinerja apratur sipil negara pada disdukcapil Kabupaten Humbang Hasundutan. *Jurnal Aplikasi Bisnis Dan Manajemen (JABM)*, 7(3), 752.
- Yalcin, I., & Seker, M. (2016). Examination of interaction and statistical differences between information and communication within internal control and managers' perceived communication skills. *European Scientific Journal*, 12(8).
- Zahra, N. (2015). Pengaruh gaya kepemimpinan terhadap komitmen organisasi melalui aspek kepuasan kerja karyawan dan kepercayaan pada sektor perbankan. *Jurnal Manajemen Dan Pemasaran Jasa*, 8(1), 145–162.